

## Theory and History of Ontology

by Raul Corazzon | e-mail: rc@ontology.co

## Selected Bibliography on the Ontology of John Duns Scotus

### BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. *De Doctrina Ioannis Duns Scoti. Vol. Ii: Problemata Philosophica.* 1968. Roma: Commissionis Scotisticae.  
  
Acta Congressus Scotistici Internationalis Oxonii et Edimburgi 11-17 sept. 1966 celebrati.
2. "John Duns Scotus." 1993. *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 67.  
  
Special issue on John Duns Scotus. Table of contents: Allan B. Wolter, O.F.M.: Reflections on the life and works of Scotus pp. 1-36; Francis J. Catania: John Duns Scotus on *Ens Infinitum* pp. 37-54; Ansgar Santogrossi, O.S.B.: Duns Scotus on potency opposed to act in *Questions on the Metaphysics*, IX pp. 55-76; Martin M. Tweedale: Duns Scotus's doctrine on Universals and the Aphrodisian tradition pp. 77-94; Allan B. Wolter, O.F.M.: Scotus on the divine origin of possibility pp. 95-108; John Boler: Transcending the natural: Duns Scotus on the two affection of the will pp. 109-126; Mary Elizabeth Ingham, C.S.J.: Scotus and moral order pp. 127-140
3. Aertsen, Jan. 1998. "Being and One: The Doctrine of the Convertible Transcendentals in Duns Scotus." *Franciscan Studies* no. 56:47-64.
4. Alanen, Lilli. 1985. "Descartes, Duns Scotus and Ockham on Omnipotence and Possibility." *Franciscan Studies* no. 45:157-188.
5. Andrews, Robert. 2003. "The Modistae and John Duns Scotus's *Questiones Super Perihermeneias*." In *Aristotle's Peri Hermeneias in the Latin Middle Ages Essays on the Commentary Tradition*, edited by Braakhuis, Henk A.G. and Kneepkens, Corneille Henri, 67-83. Groningen: Ingenium Publishers.
6. Balic, Karl. 1965. "The Nature and Value of a Critical Edition of the Complete Works of John Duns Scotus." *Studies in Philosophy and the History of Philosophy* no. 3:368-379.
7. ———. 1965. "The Life and Works of John Duns Scotus." In *John Duns Scotus, 1265-1965*, edited by Ryan, John K. and Bonansea, Bernardine, 1-27. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
8. ———. 1966. *John Duns Scotus: Some Reflections on the Occasion of the Seventh Centenary of His Birth.* Roma: Scotistic Commission.
9. Barth, Timotheus. 1965. "Being, Univocity and Analogy According to Duns Scotus." In *Johon Duns Scotus 1265-1965*, edited by Ryan, John K. and Bonansea, Bernardine, 210-262. Washington: The Catholic University of America Press.
10. Bastit, Michel. 1997. *Les Principes Des Choses En Ontologie Médiévale: Thomas D'Aquin, Scot, Occam.* Bordeaux: Éditions Bière.

11. Bérubé, Camille. 1984. "La Première École Scotiste." In *Preuve Et Raisons À L'université De Paris. Logique, Ontologie Et Théologie Au Xive Siècle*, edited by Kaluza, Zénon and Vignaux, Paul, 9-24. Paris: Vrin.
- "En 1928, étudiant en philosophie, je me voyais assigner comme dissertation une synthèse de la métaphysique scotiste. Je remis un essai sur l'être, la distinction formelle, les universaux et la nature commune. Je ne sais ce qu'il me faut admirer le plus des deux: ma présomption juvénile ou le charisme prophétique de mon professeur. C'est ce noviciat scotiste qui me vaut de vous parler, un demi-siècle plus tard, de la première école scotiste, dans cette université où l'esprit subtil d'un frère mineur d'Écosse lui a donné naissance.
- Je me suis initié au scotisme dans la *Philosophie du Bx Jean Duns Scot* d'Ephrem Longpré, et dans *l'Avicenne et le point de départ de Duns Scot* d'E. Gilson, deux médiévistes qui faisaient alors une tournée de conférences à Montréal. Quelques années plus tard, je voulus déposer un sujet de thèse sur l'être, objet de l'intelligence et de la métaphysique selon Duns Scot. Quand le professeur eut compris que je me proposais de critiquer mes deux guides, il m'avisait de changer le sujet, parce qu'aucun jury ne me donnerait raison contre ces deux médiévistes chevronnés, même s'ils n'étaient pas d'accord entre eux. Autant valait changer tout de suite. Je me rabattis sur la théorie de la connaissance chez Duns Scot pour finir par *La connaissance de l'individuel au moyen âge*. La publication de l'ouvrage aux Presses universitaires de France et la préface magistrale de Paul Vignaux me valurent de passer pour son élève. Je me sens donc à l'aise parmi vous que l'amitié réunit autour d'un vénérable maître, avec qui j'ai partagé pendant vingt ans l'enseignement de la pensée franciscaine à l'Institut d'études médiévales de l'université de Montréal.
- I. La naissance du scotisme.
- Je me suis intéressé de bonne heure à l'école scotiste, en raison de l'imbroglio que j'y découvris au sujet de la connaissance du singulier et dont je trouvai la clef en dépistant parmi les incunables de la bibliothèque un livre, fait de textes de Scot, dont l'auteur était Antoine André. Je compris que, pour remonter jusqu'à Scot à partir des scotistes, il me fallait passer par sa médiation. Il y a quelques années, en faisant la recension du volume VII de *l'Ordinatio* de Scot, je manifestai quelque réticence sur l'efficacité du recours au commentaire littéral d'Antoine André sur la *Métaphysique* d'Aristote, publié sous son nom en 1482, mais édité de nouveau sous le titre *d'Expositio*, en 1501, par Maurice du Port l'attribuant cette fois à Scot, parce que, selon les éditeurs de *l'Ordinatio*, le disciple n'aurait, en somme, que repris à son compte un commentaire du Docteur Subtil. J'avais consigné le résultat de ma première étude dans mon livre sur la connaissance du singulier, mais puisque cela était passé inaperçu, il fallait reprendre le problème du crédit à accorder à Antoine André comme témoin et interprète de Scot, là où Aristote entre en jeu. J'y reviendrai dans la dernière partie de cette communication.
- En parlant de l'école primitive, je veux me limiter à un point de vue. J'ai essayé de comprendre dans quel esprit et selon quelles méthodes les disciples de Scot ont transmis ce trésor de doctrines émanées des lèvres de leur Maître autant que de ses écrits. Cela me paraît une condition préalable pour rejoindre à travers eux le message original de Scot dans sa verbeur primitive, et comprendre ce qui fait du Docteur Subtil un des grands penseurs de l'histoire." pp. 9-10
12. Bettoni, Efre. 1961. *Duns Scotus. The Basic Principles of His Philosophy*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
- Translated from the Italian edition (1946) and edited by Bernardine Bonansea.  
Reprint: Westport, Greenwood Press, 1978.
13. ———. 1966. *Duns Scotus Filosofo*. Milano: Vita e Pensiero.
14. Boler, John. 1965. "Scotus and Intuition: Some Remarks." *Monist* no. 49:551-570.
- "The thesis of this article is that Scotus makes a special contribution with his theory of intuition, not for giving new answers to the questions asked, for example, by Aquinas, but for asking different questions; and that the significance of this contribution cannot be appreciated until one sees why, with respect to the questions asked by Aquinas, Scotus is in (substantial) agreement with the Aristotelian analysis. The author tries, in an informal way, (1) to point out some confusions that have led to a misunderstanding of Scotus's (or anyone else's) defense of an Aristotelian account of abstraction, and (2) to isolate the phenomena that makes Scotus's theory of intuition suggestive."
15. ———. 1990. "The Moral Psychology of Duns Scotus: Some Preliminary Questions." *Franciscan Studies* no. 50:31-56.

16. Bonansea, Bernardine. 1983. *Man and His Approach to God in John Duns Scotus*. Lanham: University Press of America.
17. Bos, Egbert Peter. 1987. "The Theory of the Proposition According to John Duns Scotus' Two Commentaries on Aristotle's *Perihermeneias*." In *Logos and Pragma. Essays on the Philosophy of Language in Honour of Professor Gabriel Nuchelmans*, edited by Rijk, Lambertus Marie de and Braakhuis, Henk A.G., 121-139. Nijmegen: Ingenium Publishers.
18. ———, ed. 1998. *John Duns Scotus (1265/6-1308). Renewal of Philosophy*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Acts of the Third Symposium organized by the Dutch Society for Medieval Philosophy *Medium Aevum* (May 23 and 24, 1996).  
 Contents: E. P. Bos: Introduction VII-XIV; 1. Wolfgang Kluxen: On metaphysics and the concept of freedom in the philosophy of John Duns Scotus 1; 2. Jan A. Aertsen: Being and the One: the doctrine of the convertible transcendentals in Duns Scotus 13; 3. Jos Decorte: *Creatio* and *conservatio* as *relatio* 27; 4. A. Vos: Duns Scotus and Aristotle 49; 5. A. Vos: Knowledge, certainty and contingency 75; 6. Ria van der Lecq: Duns Scotus on the reality of possible worlds 89; 7. Eef Dekker: Does Duns Scotus need Molina? On divine foreknowledge and co-causality 101; 8. Eef Dekker: Scotus's freedom of the will revisited 113; 9. A. J. Beck: 'Divine psychology' and modalities: Scotus's theory of the neutral proposition 123; 10. Joke Spruyt: Duns Scotus's criticism of Henry of Ghent's notion of free will 139; 11. Rudi te Velde: *Natura in seipsa recurva est*: Duns Scotus and Aquinas on the relationship between nature and will 155; 12. H. Paul F. Mercken: Necessity and the moral order: Scotus's interpretation of the *Lex Naturae* in the perspective of Western philosophical ethics 171; 13. E. P. Bos and A. C. van der Helm: The division of Being over the categories according to Albert the Great, Thomas Aquinas and John Duns Scotus 183; Maarten J. F. M. Hoenen: Scotus and the Scotist school. The tradition of Scotist thought in the medieval and early modern period 197; Bibliography 211; Indexes 227-237.
19. Boulnois, Olivier. 1989. "Analogie Et Univocité Selon Duns Scot: La Double Destruction." *Études Philosophiques*:347-369.
20. ———. 1992. "Réelles Intentions: Nature Commune Et Universaux Selon Duns Scot." *Revue de Métaphysique et de Morale* no. 97:3-34.
21. ———. 1995. "Quand Commence L'ontothéologie? Aristote, Thomas D'Aquin Et Duns Scot." *Revue Thomiste* no. 95:85-108.
22. ———. 1999. *Être Et Représentation, Une Généalogie De La Métaphysique Moderne À L'époque De Duns Scot, XIIIe-XIVe Siècle*. Paris: Press universitaires de France.
23. ———. 1999. "Théologie, Métaphysique Et Représentation De L'être Selon Duns Scot." *Cahiers de la Revue de Théologie et de Philosophie* no. 20:83-102.
- Métaphysiques Médiévales. Études en l'Honneur d'André de Muralt* - Éditées par Curzio Chiesa et Léo Freuler.
24. Boulnois, Olivier, Karger, Elizabeth, Solère, Jean-Luc, and Sondag, Gérard, eds. 2004. *Duns Scot À Paris 1302-2002*. Turnhout: Brepols.
- Actes du Colloque de Paris, 2-4 septembre 2002.  
 Contents: Introduction IX; Index siglorum XXIII;  
 I - PARIS, 1302  
 Antonie Vos: Duns Scotus at Paris 3; Elsa Marmursztejn - Sylvain Piron: Duns Scot et la politique. Pouvoir du prince et conversion des Juifs 21;  
 II - THÉORIE DE L'ESPRIT, ÉPISTÉMOLOGIE, SÉMANTIQUE  
 Peter King: Duns Scotus on mental content 65; Dominique Demange: "Objet premier d'inclusion virtuelle". Introduction à la théorie de la science de Jean Duns Scot 89; Christopher J. Martin: Formal consequence in Scotus and Ockham: towards an account of Scotus' logic 117; Jacques Chollet - Gérard Sondag: Sur la signification du terme *fortè* dans le latin de Jean Duns Scot 151;

## III - MÉTAPHYSIQUE

Ludger Honnefelder: Étienne Gilson et Jean Duns Scot: l' *Être et l'essence* et l'histoire de la métaphysique 179; Pasquale Porro: Duns Scot et le point de rupture avec Avicenne 195; Olivier Boulnois: Au-delà de la physique? 219; Timothy B. Noone: L'univocité dans les *Quaestiones super libros de anima* 255; Giorgio Pini: Substance, accident, and inherence. Scotus and the Paris debate on the metaphysics of the Eucharist 273; Fabrizio Mondadori: The independence of the possible according to Scotus 313; Joachim R. Sider: La doctrine scotiste de la contingence dans la *Reportatio I A* 375; Joel Biard: Duns Scot et l'infini dans la nature 387;

## IV - PSYCHOLOGIE ET ÉTHIQUE

Mary B. Ingham: La genèse de la volonté rationnelle de la *Lectura* à la *Reportatio* 409; Christophe Cervellon: L'affection de justice chez Duns Scot. Justice et luxure dans le péché de l'ange 425; Jean-Michel Counet: Le lien entre la prudence et les vertus morales chez Duns Scot 469; Tobias Hoffmann: *L'akrasia* selon Duns Scot 487; Gilles Berceville o.p: Du miracle au surnaturel. De Thomas d'Aquin à Duns Scot: un changement de problématique 563; Luc Mathieu o.f.m: Était-il nécessaire que le Christ mourût sur la croix? Réflexion sur la liberté absolue de Dieu et la liberté de Jésus-homme, d'après Jean Duns Scot 581;

## VI - PARIS, 2002

Axel Schmidt: The concept of time in theology and physics 595; Ansgar Santogrossi o.s.b: Soi, intersubjectivité et langage chez Duns Scot 607; Emmanuel Falque: L'autre singulier: l'haecécité d'autrui et l'horizon de la finitude 623;

## INDEX

Index scoticum 665; Index manuscriptorum 675; Index nominum 677.

25. Brown, O.J. 1979. "Individuation and Actual Existence in Scotistic Metaphysics: A Thomistic Assessment." *New Scholasticism* no. 53:347-361.
26. Brown, Stephen F. 1965. "Avicenna and the Unity of the Concept of Being. The Interpretations of Henry of Ghent, Duns Scotus, Gerard of Bologna and Peter Aureoli." *Franciscan Studies* no. 25:117-150.  
  
"This article treats the question of the analogy and the univocity of being in Henry of Ghent, John Duns Scotus, Hervaeus Natalis, Gerard of Bologna and Peter Aureoli. Each provides his own view of the concept of being and thus each gives a different interpretation to Avicenna's metaphysical starting point"
27. Carbajo Núñez, Martín, ed. 2008. *Giovanni Duns Scoto. Studi E Ricerche Nel Vii Centenario Della Sua Morte. In Onore Di P. César Saco Alarcón*. Roma: Antonianum.  
  
Due volumi.
28. Cesalli, Laurent. 2007. *Le Réalisme Propositionnel. Sémantique Et Ontologie Des Propositions Chez Jean Duns Scot, Gauthier Burley, Richard Brinkley Et Jean Wyclif*. Paris: Vrin.
29. ———. 2009. "Le Signifié Propositionnel Selon Jean Duns Scot Et Gauthier Burley." In *Philosophical Debates at Paris in the Early Fourteenth Century*, edited by Brown, Stephen F., Dewender, Thomas and Kobusch, Theo, 465-482. Leiden: Brill.
30. Cross, Richard. 1998. *The Physics of Duns Scotus. The Scientific Context of a Theological Vision*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
31. ———. 1999. *Duns Scotus*. New York: Oxford University Press.
32. ———. 2002. *The Metaphysics of the Incarnation: Thomas Aquinas to Duns Scotus*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.
33. Da Costa Santos, Rogério. 1998. *L'ontologie Du Contingent Selon Jean Duns Scot. Étude Sur Les Origines Du Possible Et De La Représentation En Dieu*. Villeneuve d'Ascq: Presses universitaires du Septentrion.
34. Dahlstrom, Daniel. 1980. "Signification and Logic: Scotus on Universals from a Logical Point of View."

*Vivarium* no. 18:81-111.

35. Day, Sebastian. 1947. *Intuitive Cognition. A Key to the Significance of the Later Scholastics*. St. Bonaventure: Franciscan Institute.
36. Demange, Dominique. 2007. *Jean Duns Scot. La Théorie Du Savoir*. Paris: Vrin.
37. ———. 2008. "Pourquoi Duns Scot a Critiqué Avicenne." In *Giovanni Duns Scoto. Studi E Ricerche Nel Vii Centenario Della Sua Morte in Onore Di P. César Saco Alarcón. Vol I*, edited by Nuñez, Martín Carbajo, 195-232. Roma: Antonianum.
38. Dumont, Stephen. 1987. "The Univocity of the Concept of Being in the Fourteenth Century: John Duns Scotus and William of Alnwick." *Mediaeval Studies* no. 49:1-75.
39. ———. 1987. "The Univocity of the Concept of Being in the Fourteenth Century: Ii. The *De Ente* of Peter Thomae." *Mediaeval Studies* no. 50:186-256.
40. ———. 1989. "Theology as a Science and Duns Scotus's Distinction between Intuitive and Abstractive Cognition." *Speculum* no. 64:579-599.
41. ———. 1992. "Transcendental Being: Scotus and Scotists." *Topoi* no. 11:135-148.

"Of singular importance to the medieval theory of transcendentals was the position of John Duns Scotus that there could be a concept of being univocally common, not only to substance and accidents, but even to God and creatures. Scotus's doctrine of univocal transcendental concepts violated the accepted view that, owing to its generality, no transcendental notion could be univocal. The major difficulty facing Scotus's doctrine of univocity was to explain how a real, as opposed to a purely logical, concept could be abstracted from what agreed in nothing real, in this case, God and creatures. The present article examines Scotus's solution to this difficulty and its interpretation in four of his noted fourteenth-century followers. It is shown that the balance Scotus's solution achieved between the competing demands of the real diversity between God and creatures, on the one side, and the conceptual unity of transcendental being, on the other, is taken in opposed directions by his interpreters. Either the real diversity of God and creatures is given priority, so that the concept of being becomes a purely logical notion, or the real unity of the concept of being is stressed, so that some sort of real community is posited between God and creatures."

42. ———. 1992. "The *Propositio Famosa Scoti*: Duns Scotus and Ockham on the Possibility of a Science of Theology." *Dialogue. Canadian Philosophical Review* no. 31:415-430.
43. ———. 1995. "The Origin of Scotus's Theory of Synchronic Contingency." *Modern Schoolman* no. 72:149-167.

"It has been widely accepted in the literature that Scotus was the first to advance the so-called synchronic' view of contingency, where something is contingent if, at the very moment when it occurs, there is a real possibility for its opposite. This is usually contrasted with a statistical' construction of contingency, found in Aristotle and scholastics before Scotus, according to which something is contingent if its opposite can be actually realized at some other time. The present article examines the background to Scotus's treatment of this theory of synchronic contingency and traces its proximate origin to Peter Olivi."

44. ———. 1999. "L'univocité Selon Duns Scot Et La Tradition Médiévale De La Métaphysique." *Philosophie* no. 61:27-49.
45. ———. 1999. "La Doctrine Scotiste De L'univocité Et La Tradition Médiévale De La Métaphysique." *Philosophie* no. 61:27-49.
46. ———. 2005. "Duns Scotus's Parisian Question on the Formal Distinction." *Vivarium* no. 43:7-62.

"The degree of realism that Duns Scotus understood his formal distinction to have implied is a matter of dispute going back to the fourteenth century. Both modern and medieval commentators alike have seen Scotus's later, Parisian treatment of the formal distinction as less realist in the sense that it would deny any extra-mentally separate formalities or realities. This less realist reading depends in large part on a question known to scholars only in the highly corrupt edition of Luke Wadding, where it is printed as the first of the otherwise spurious *Quaestiones miscellaneae de formalitatibus*. The present study examines this question in detail. Cited by Scotus's contemporaries as the *Quaestio logica Scoti*, we establish that it was a special disputation held by Scotus at Paris in response to criticisms of his use of the formal distinction in God, identify its known manuscripts, and provide an analysis based upon a corrected text, showing in particular the total unreliability of the Wadding edition. Our analysis shows that the *Logica Scoti* does not absolutely prohibit an assertion of formalities as correlates of the formal distinction, even in the divine Person, so long as their non-identity is properly qualified. That is, the positing of formalities does not of itself entail an unqualified or absolute distinction."

47. Etzkorn, Girard J. 1991. "The Scotus Edition: John Duns Scotus's Philosophical Works." *Franciscan Studies* no. 51:117-130.
48. Frank, William A., and Wolter, Allan Bernard. 1995. *Duns Scotus, Metaphysician*. West Lafayette: Purdue University Press.
49. Gilson, Étienne. 1952. *Jean Duns Scot. Introduction a Ses Positions Fondamentales*. Paris: Vrin.
50. Gracia, Jorge J.E. 1998. "Scotus Conception of Metaphysics: The Study of the Transcendentals." *Franciscan Studies* no. 56:153-168.
51. Grajewski, Maurice. 1944. *The Formal Distinction of Duns Scotus. A Study in Metaphysics*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
52. Harris, Charles Reginald Schiller. 1959. *Duns Scotus*. New York: The Humanities Press.  
  
Two volumes: 1. The place of Duns Scotus in medieval thought; 2. The philosophical doctrines of Duns Scotus.  
Reprint: Bristol, Thoemmes Press, 1994.
53. Hechich, Barnaba. 2008. "Il Problema Delle 'Reportationes' Nell'eredità Dottrinale Del B. Giovanni Duns Scoto." In *Giovanni Duns Scoto. Studi E Ricerche Nel VII Centenario Della Sua Morte in Onore Di P. César Saco Alarcón. Vol I*, edited by Nuñez, Martín Carbajo, 59-128. Roma: Antonianum.
54. Hoffmann, Tobias. 2002. *Creatura Intellecta. Die Ideen Und Possibilien Bei Duns Scotus Mit Ausblick Auf Franz Von Mayronis, Poncius Und Mastrius*. Münster: Aschendorff.
55. Honnefelder, Ludger. 1979. *Ens Inquantum Ens. Der Begriff Des Seienden Als Solchen Als Gegenstand Der Metaphysik Nach Der Lehre Des Johannes Duns Scotus*. Münster: Aschendorff.
56. ———. 1990. *Scientia Transcendens. Die Formale Bestimmung Der Seiendheit Und Realitat in Der Metaphysik Des Mitt Elalters Und Der Neuzeit (Duns Scotus - Suarez - Wolff - Kant - Peirce)*. Hamburg: Meiner.
57. ———. 1997. "Zum Begriff Der Moglichen Welt in J.A. Comenius's 'Consultatio Catholica'." *Franciscan Studies* no. 54:277-288.
58. ———. 2005. *Johannes Duns Scotus*. München: C. H. Beck.
59. Honnefelder, Ludger, Wood, Rega, and Dreyer, Mechtild, eds. 1996. *John Duns Scotus. Metaphysics and Ethics*. Leiden: Brill.

Contents: Vorwort IX; Ludger Honnefelder: Metaphysik und Ethik bei Johannes Duns Scotus:

Forschungsergebnisse und -perspektiven. Eine Einführung 1;

#### HISTORICAL CONTEXT

Allan B. Wolter: Reflections about Scotus's early works 37; Stephen D. Dumont: William of Ware, Richard of Conington and the *Collationes Oxonienses* of John Duns Scotus 59; Mechthild Dreyer: Eissenschaft als Satzsystem. Die *Theoremata* des Johannes Duns Scotus und die Entwicklung des kategorisch-deduktiven Wissenschaftsbegriffs 87; Gordon A. Wilson: The presence of Henry of Ghent in Scotus's *Quaestiones super libros Metaphysicorum* 107;

#### MODALITY

Simo Knuuttila: Duns Scotus and the foundations of logical modalities 127; John Boler: The ontological commitment of Scotus's account of potency in his *Questions on the Metaphysics*, book IX 145; Calvin G. Normore: Scotus, modality, instants of nature and the contingency of the present 161; Steven P. Marrone: Revisiting Duns Scotus and Henry of Ghent on modality 175; Stanislav Sousedik: Der Streit um den wahren Sinn der scotischen possibilienlehre 191; Neil Lewis: Power and contingency in Robert Grosseteste and Duns Scotus 205;

#### INDIVIDUATION

Jorge .J. E. Gracia: Individuality and the individuating entity in Scotus's *Ordinatio*: an ontological characterization 229; Rega Wood: individual forms: Richard Rufus and John Duns Scotus 251; Woosuk Park: Understanding the problem of individuation: Gracia vs. Scotus 273;

#### BEING AND UNIVOCITY

Olivier Boulnois: Duns Scot, théoricien de l'analogie de l'être 293; Maria Burger: Univozität des Seienden - Univozität der Person: Zwei Grenzbegriffe 317; Stephen F. Brown: L'unité du concept d'être au début du quatorzième siècle 327; Theo O. Kobusch: Das Seiende als transzendentaler oder supertranszendentaler Begriff. Deutungen der Univozität des Begriffs bei Scotus und den Scotisten 345; Jan P. Beckmann: Entdecken oder Setzen? Die Besonderheit der relationstheorie des Duns Scotus und ihre Bedeutung für die metaphysik 367; Gérard Sondag: Universel et *natura communis* dans l' *Ordinatio* et dans les *Questions sur le Perihermeneias* (une brève comparaison) 385; Jakob Hans Josef Schneider: *Utrum haec sit vera: Caesar est animal, Caesare non existente*. Zum *Peri-Hermeneias*-Kommentar des Johannes Duns Scotus 393;

#### THE EXISTENCE OF THE FIRST BEING

Alessandro Ghisalberti: *Ens infinitum* e dimostrazione dell'esistenza di Dio in Duns Scotus 415; Timothy O'Connor: From First Efficient Cause to God: Scotus on the identification stage of the cosmological argument 435; Luis Alberto de Boni: bedeutung und grenzen des aristotelischen Denkens im Gottesbeweis von Duns Scotus 455; Rolf Schönberger: *Negations non summe amamus*. Duns Scotus' auseinandersetzung mit der negativen Theologie 475;

#### ETHICS

Marilyn McCord Adams: Scotus and Ockham on the connection of the virtues 499; Fernando Inciarte: Scotus' Gebrauch des Begriffs der praktischen Wahrheit im philosophiegeschichtlichen Kontext 523; Hans-Joachim Werner: Die Erfassung des Schönen in seiner personalen und ethischen Bedeutung bei Duns Scotus 535; Mary Elizabeth Ingham: Practical wisdom: Scotus's presentation of Prudence 551; Hannes Möhle: Wille und Moral. Zur Voraussetzung der Ethik des Johannes Duns Scotus und ihrer Bedeutung für die Ethik Immanuel Kants 573; Indices 595; Index fontium 597; Index nominum 600; Index rerum 606.

60. Iammarrone, Luigi. 1999. *Giovanni Duns Scotus Metafisico E Teologo: Le Tematiche Fondamentali Della Sua Filosofia E Teologia*. Roma: Miscellanea Francescana.
61. Ingham, Mary Elizabeth. 2003. *Scotus for Dunces: An Introduction to the Subtle Doctor*. St. Bonaventure: Franciscan Institute Publications.
62. Ingham, Mary Elizabeth, and Dreyer, Mechthild. 2004. *The Philosophical Vision of John Duns Scotus. An Introduction*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
63. King, Peter. 2001. "Duns Scotus on Possibilities, Powers, and the Possible." In *Potentialität Und Possibilität. Modalaussagen in Der Geschichte Der Metaphysik*, edited by Buchheim, Thomas, Kneepkens, Corneille Henri and Lorenz, Kuno, 175-199. Stuttgart: Frommann-Holzboog.
64. Knuuttila, Simo. 1986. "Being Qua Being in Thomas Aquinas and John Duns Scotus." In *The Logic of Being. Historical Studies*, edited by Knuuttila, Simo and Hintikka, Jaakko, 201-222. Dordrecht: Reidel.

65. Krop, Henri A. 1987. "The Self-Knowledge of God. Duns Scotus and Ockham on the Formal Object of Scientific Knowledge." In *Ockham and Ockhamists*, edited by Bos, Egbert Peter and Krop, Henri A., 83-92. Nijmegen: Ingenium Publishers.
  66. Langston, Douglas. 1979. "Scotus and Ockham on the Univocal Concept of Being." *Franciscan Studies* no. 39:105-129.
  67. ———. 1993. "Scotus's Doctrine of Intuitive Cognition." *Synthese* no. 96:3-24.
  68. Lusser, Dominik. 2006. *Individua Substantia. Interpretation Und Umdeutung Des Aristotelischen Ousia-Begriffs Bei Thomas Von Aquin Und Johannes Duns Scotus*. Bern: Peter Lang.
  69. Manno, Ambrogio Giacomo. 1994. *Introduzione Al Pensiero Di Giovanni Duns Scoto*. Bari: Levante.
  70. Marmo, Costantino. 1989. "Ontology and Semantics in the Logic of Duns Scotus." In *On the Medieval Theory of Signs*, edited by Eco, Umberto and Marmo, Costantino, 143-193. Amsterdam: John Benjamins.
  71. Marrone, Steven P. 1983. "The Notion of Univocity in Duns Scotus' S Early Writings." *Franciscan Studies* no. 43:347-395.
  72. ———. 1988. "Henry of Ghent and Duns Scotus on the Knowledge of Being." *Speculum* no. 63:22-57.
  73. ———. 1998. "Duns Scotus on Metaphysical Potency and Possibility." *Franciscan Studies* no. 56:265-289.
  74. Martinich, Aloysius P. 1977. "Scotus and Anselm on the Existence of God." *Franciscan Studies* no. 37:139-152.
  75. McKeon, Richard. 1965. "The Relation of Logic to Metaphysics in the Philosophy of Duns Scotus." *Monist* no. 49:519-550.
- "In the development of logical theory from the Twelfth to the Fourteenth century, the "new logic" was distinguished from the "old logic" when the last four books of Aristotle's "Organon" were translated, and the "modern logic" was distinguished from the "ancient logic" when the principles of demonstration were found in rhetorical or dialectical topics or sophistical paradoxes rather than in analytical causes. The "old logic" and the "new logic" continued to be used to designate two sets of problems, and William of Ockham wrote treatises on both. "Moderns" was not a synonym for "nominalists" in the Fourteenth century, and the innovations in logic of that century were made by both "ancients" and "moderns." According to Duns Scotus the problems of the old logic are problems of the interpretation of sentences and the definition of simple terms from that interpretation; the problems of the new logic are problems of the analysis of inference and the interpretation of sentences from that analysis."
76. Noone, Timothy B. 1993. "Alnwick on the Origin, Nature and Function of the Formal Distinction." *Franciscan Studies* no. 53:231-245.
  77. O'Brien, Andrew Joseph. 1964. "Duns Scotus' Teaching on the Distinction between Essence and Existence." *New Scholasticism* no. 38:61-77.
  78. O'Meara, William. 1965. "Actual Existence and the Individual According to Duns Scotus." *Monist* no. 49:659-669.
  79. Parisoli, Luca. 2008. "Oggetti E Norme: Ontologia E Volontà Nella Lettura Oraaconsistente Di Giovanni Duns Scoto." In *Giovanni Duns Scoto. Studi E Ricerche Nel Vii Centenario Della Sua Morte in Onore Di P. César Saco Alarcón. Vol I*, edited by Nuñez, Martín Carbajo, 395-427. Roma: Antonianum.



80. Park, Woosuk. 1988. "The Problem of Individuation for Scotus: A Principle of Indivisibility or a Principle of Distinction." *Franciscan Studies* no. 48:105-123.
81. ———. 1988. *Haecceitas and the Bare Particular: A Study of Duns Scotus' Theory of Individuation*, State University of New York at Buffalo.  
Available at UMI Dissertation Express. Order number: 8905467.
82. ———. 1990. "Scotus, Frege and Bergmann." *Modern Schoolman* no. 67:259-273.
83. ———. 1990. "Haecceitas and the Bare Particular." *Review of Metaphysics* no. 44:375-397.
84. Perler, Dominik. 1993. "Duns Scotus on Signification." *Medieval Philosophy and Theology* no. 3:97-120.  
  
"In both versions of his *Commentary on the Sentences*, Scotus alludes to a great controversy among his contemporaries over the question of whether a spoken word signifies a thing or a concept. He does not give a detailed account of this controversy, but confines himself to saying, "in short, I grant that what is properly signified by a spoken word is a thing." This brief statement may seem trivial at first sight, but it turns out to be innovative when it is assessed against the background of medieval Aristotelian semantic theory. From Boethius onwards, the overwhelming majority of the commentators on *De interpretatione* held that it is a concept and not a thing that is primarily and directly signified by a spoken word.  
In this paper, I intend to examine the reasons that led Scotus to criticize and revise the dominant theory. Such an examination can scarcely be restricted to a logico-semantical analysis. An adequate understanding of the relationship between a sign and its significate not only necessitates an examination of the question of *how* this relationship is established, but also a discussion of the question of *what* exactly the sign and the significate are—what kind of entities they are. Therefore, the following analysis aims at investigating not only the semantic aspects of Scotus's theory of signification, but also its ontological commitments." (notes omitted).
85. Pickavé, Martin. 2010. "Henry of Ghent and John Duns Scotus on Skepticism and the Possibility of Naturally Acquired Knowledge." In *Rethinking the History of Skepticism. The Missing Medieval Background*, edited by Lagerlund, Henrik, 61-96. Leiden: Brill.
86. Pini, Giorgio. 1999. "Duns Scotus' Commentary on the *Topics*: New Light on His Philosophical Teaching." *Archives d'Histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Age* no. 66:225-243.
87. ———. 2000. "Species, Concept, and Thing: Theories of Signification in the Second Half of the Thirteenth Century." *Medieval Philosophy and Theology* no. 8:21-52.
88. ———. 2001. "Signification of Names in Duns Scotus and Some of His Contemporaries." *Vivarium* no. 39:20-51.
89. ———. 2002. *Scoto E L'analogia. Logica E Metafisica Nei Commenti Aristotelici*. Pisa: Scuola Normale Superiore.
90. ———. 2002. *Categories and Logic in Duns Scotus. An Interpretation of Aristotle's Categories in the Late Thirteenth Century*. Leiden: Brill.
91. ———. 2005. "Scotus' Realist Conception of the Categories: His Legacy to Late Medieval Debates." *Vivarium* no. 43:63-110.
92. Prentice, Robert. 1968. "Univocity and Analogy According to Scotus' *Super Libros Elenchorum Aristotelis*." *Archives d'Histoire doctrinale et littéraire du Moyen Age* no. 35:39-64.

93. ———. 1970. *The Basic Quidditative Metaphysics of Duns Scotus as Seen in His De Primo Principio*. Roma: Antonianum.
94. ———. 1974. *An Anonymous Question on the Unity of the Concept of Being (Attributed to Scotus)*. Roma: L.I.E.F.
95. Reichmann, James B. 2006. "Scotus and *Haecceitas*, Aquinas and *Esse*: A Comparative Study." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 80:63-75.

"This study compares the teachings of Thomas Aquinas and John Duns Scotus on the issue of being and individuality. Its primary aim is to contrast Scotus's individuating principle, *haecceitas*, with Aquinas's actualizing principle, *esse*, attending both to their rather striking similarities as well as to their significant differences. The article's conclusion is that, while Scotus's crowning principle, *haecceitas*, is the unique entity internal to each thing, rendering the nature complete and singular as nature, Aquinas's crowning principle, *esse*, actualizes the nature without individualizing it. This is not to imply that Scotus overlooked the importance of a thing's being, any more than Aquinas overlooked the importance of a being's singularity. It does mean, however, that the primal integrating focus and the resulting philosophical synthesis of these two seminal thinkers of the Middle Ages did significantly differ. The conclusion of the paper might be stated thus: what most distinguishes their respective philosophies is that, while Scotus's primary concern was with the existing individual, Aquinas's was with the existing individual."

96. Richter, Vladimir. 1991. "Duns Scotus' Text Zur Univozität." In *Historia Philosophiae Medii Aevi. Studien Zur Geschichte Der Philosophie Des Mittelalters*, edited by Mojsisch, Burkhard and Pluta, Olaf, 899-1028. Amsterdam: R. Grüner.
97. Rijk, Lambertus Marie de. 2003. "The Logic of Indefinite Names in Boethius, Abelard, Duns Scotus, and Radulphus Brito." In *Aristotle's Peri Hermeneias in the Latin Middle Ages. Essays on the Commentary Tradition*, edited by Braakhuis, Henk A.G. and Kneepkens, Corneille Henri, 207-233. Groningen: Ingenium Publishers.
98. Ryan, John K., and Bonansea, Bernardine, eds. 1965. *John Duns Scotus, 1265-1965*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.

Contents: J. K. Ryan: Foreword VII; 1. Charles Balic: The life and works of John Duns Scotus 1; 2. Efreim Bettoni: The originality of the Scotistic synthesis 28; 3. John K. Ryan: The Formal Distinction 45; 4. S. F. Watson: A problem for Realism: our multiple concepts of individual things and the solution of Duns Scotus 61; 5. Bernardine Bonansea: Duns Scotus' voluntarism; 6. J. R. Cresswell: Duns Scotus on the *Common Nature* 122; 7. Felix Alluntis: Demonstrability and demonstration of the existence of God 133; 8. Roy Efer: Duns Scotus and the physical approach to God 171; 9. Geoffrey G. Bridges: The Problem of the demonstrability of immortality 191; 10. Timotheus A. Barth: Being, univocity, and analogy according to Duns Scotus 210; 11. Walter Hoeres: Francis Suarez and the teaching of John Duns Scotus on *Univocatio Entis* 263; 12. Ignatius Brady: William of Vaurouillon, O.F.M., a Fifteenth century Scotist 291; 13. Heiko Augustinus Oberman: Duns Scotus, nominalism, and the Council of Trent 311; 14. Béraud de Saint-Maurice: The contemporary significance of Duns Scotus' philosophy 345; 15. Charles Balic: The nature and value of a critical edition of the complete works of John Duns Scotus 368; Notes on Contributors 380; Index 382-384.

"The names of certain of the great scholastic thinkers of the middle ages—St. Anselm, Abelard, Hugh of St. Victor, St. Albert the Great, St. Thomas Aquinas, St. Bonaventure, Roger Bacon, John Duns Scotus, Henry of Ghent, and the rest—are familiar not only to students of philosophy and theology but also in varying degrees to the educated public. Abelard is known for his *Historia calamitatum* and as a figure in romantic literature, if not for his work in ethics and the theory of knowledge. Like Zeno's paradoxes and the Cartesian "cogito ergo sum," a passage in St. Anselm has become the subject of unending discussion. Certain of St. Bonaventure's books have been translated and find readers. But with the exception of St. Thomas Aquinas first-hand knowledge of the writings of the medieval masters is not a common thing. For reasons that have varied throughout the modern era John Duns Scotus has not always received the general recognition that what he was and what he did should have brought to him. However, inadequate understanding and even hostility are being displaced by something better. Appropriately, this change is due in large measure to the research and writings of his fellow Franciscans, but the books and articles of many other scholars have aided them in their labors. As a result, the record of Scotus' life has been made

fuller and clearer, what he actually taught on various subjects has been brought to light, and translations of his writings begin to appear. But the most important thing of all is the essential work of the *Commissio Scotistica* on the canon and the critical edition of his writings, which proceeds year by year in spite of the inherent difficulties of the task and those caused by the turmoil of our era. To all such labors the present volume, a cooperative effort of European, American, and Canadian scholars, is added as a further monument raised in honor of John Duns Scotus on the seventh centennial of his birth." (from the Foreword).

99. Shircel, Cyril L. 1942. *The Univocity of the Concept of Being in the Philosophy of John Duns Scotus*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.
100. Söder, Roland. 1998. *Kontingenz Und Wissen. Die Lehre Von Den Futura Contingentia Bei Johannes Duns Scotus*. Münster: Aschendorff.
101. Sondag, Gérard. 1997. "Le Système Des Causes Dans La Philosophie Naturelle De Jean Buridan." In *Perspectives Arabes Et Médiévales Sur La Tradition Scientifique Et Philosophique Grecque*, edited by Hasnawi, Ahmad, Elamrani-Jamal, Abdelali and Aouad, Maroun, 505-521. Leuven: Peeters.  
  
Actes du colloque de la SIHSPAI (Société internationale d'histoire des sciences et de la philosophie arabes et islamiques) Paris, 31 mars - 3 avril 1993.
102. ———. 1997. "La Solution Scotiste Au Problème De L'individuation, Avec Une Conjecture Sur Ses Sources Immédiates." In *Perspectives Arabes Et Médiévales Sur La Tradition Scientifique Et Philosophique Grecque*, edited by Hasnawi, Ahmad, Elamrani-Jamal, Abdelali and Aouad, Maroun, 505-521. Leuven: Peeters.
103. ———. 2005. *Duns Scot. La Métaphysique De La Singularité*. Paris: Vrin.
104. Spruyt, Joke. 2003. "The Semantics of Complex Expressions in John Duns Scotus, Peter Abelard and John Buridan." In *Aristotle's Peri Hermeneias in the Latin Middle Ages. Essays on the Commentary Tradition*, edited by Braakhuis, Henk A.G. and Kneepkens, Corneille Henri, 275-303. Turnhout: Brepols.
105. Sylwanovicz, Michael. 1996. *Contingent Causality and the Foundations of Duns Scotus' Metaphysics*. Leiden: Brill.
106. Traina, Mariano. 1965. "La Dialectica in Giovanni Duns Scoto." In *Arts Libéraux Et Philosophie Au Moyen Age*, 923-938. Montreal: Institut d'études médiévales.
107. Tweedale, Martin M. 1963. "Scotus and Ockham on the Infinity of the Most Eminent Being." *Franciscan Studies* no. 23:257-267.
108. ———. 1993. "Duns Scotus' Doctrine on Universals and the Aphrodisian Tradition." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 67:77-93.
109. ———, ed. 1999. *Scotus Vs. Ockham - a Medieval Dispute over Universals. Vol. I: Texts*. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press.

Texts translated into English with commentary by Martin M. Tweedale.

"This work is meant to make accessible to students of philosophy and later medieval thought the key texts in one of the most crucial philosophical debates of that period. The concentration is on Scotus's positive doctrine since it is difficult and has not received the detailed attention it deserves. Ockham's polemic against Scotus raises a host of objections to the internal coherence of Scotus's reworking of the traditional line. Some of these are ones it seems to me Scotus could have countered quite easily; others would have required some revisions, but ones that are basically within the spirit of the doctrine. Some, however, are very difficult indeed, and I shall leave to the commentary and its introductory essay the exposition of my own view on whether Scotus's position can survive intact. There is also a positive side to Ockham's views about universals, and that is only partially covered in what follows. The texts that show how Ockham

envisioned preserving all the essentials of Aristotelian science even after real universals have been excised, are presented and discussed, and the very real issue of whether Ockham's effort here could possibly succeed is broached but not definitely resolved one way or the other."

110. ———. 1999. *Scotus Vs. Ockham - a Medieval Dispute over Universals. Vol. II: Commentary*. Lewiston: The Edwin Mellen Press.

"The commentary which composes the greater part of this volume attempts not only to explain the texts translated in the first volume and to understand the positions adopted by the protagonists in this debate, but also to assess the cogency of the various arguments put forward. After all that work is done, however, there remains the task of drawing attention to the crucial issues that have emerged and arriving at some understanding of the debate as a whole and the relative merits of the positions put forward. It is this task that this introductory essay undertakes. Perhaps it would be better read after a thorough study of the commentary, but I am inclined to think that some awareness of the general issues and positions taken by Scotus and Ockham helps in making one's way through the individual texts and their often elaborate argumentation. In explaining these issues and positions I have made free use of philosophical ideas of our own day, at least to the extent that this is not grossly anachronistic."

111. Vos, Antonie. 1985. "On the Philosophy of the Young Duns Scotus. Some Semantical and Logical Aspects." In *Mediaeval Semantics and Metaphysics. Studies Dedicated to L. M. De Rijk, Ph. D. On the Occasion of His 60th Birthday*, edited by Bos, Egbert Peter, 195-216. Nijmegen: Ingenium Publishers.

112. ———. 2006. *The Philosophy of John Duns Scotus*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

113. Wengert, R.G. 1965. "The Development of the Doctrine of the Formal Distinction in the *Lectura Prima* of John Duns Scotus." *Monist* no. 49:571-587.

"This article is a discussion of the vocabulary and arguments in Scotus' "Prima Lectura" which seeks to show the close relationship between the doctrine of "formal distinction" and the notion of "ultimate abstraction". The paper also suggests that in the "Prima lectura" One is in at the birth of the fully developed notion of "formal distinction" in Scotus' own thought."

114. Williams, Thomas, ed. 2003. *The Cambridge Companion to Duns Scotus*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Contents: Contributors IX; Abbreviations and method of citation XIII; Duns Scotus in English translation XV; Thomas Williams: Introduction: the life and works of John Duns the Scot 1; 1. Peter King: Scotus on metaphysics 15; 2. Neil Lewis: Space and time 69; 3. Timothy B. Noone: Universals and individuation 100; 4. Calvin G. Normore: Duns Scotus's modal theory 129; 5. Dominik Perler: Duns Scotus's philosophy of language 161; 6. James F. Ross and Todd Bates: Duns Scotus on natural theology 193; 7. William E. Mann: Duns Scotus on natural and supernatural knowledge of God 238; 8. Richard Cross: Philosophy of mind 263; 9. Robert Pasnau: Cognition 285; 10. Hannes Möhle: Scotus's theory of natural law 312; 11. Thomas Williams: From metaethics to action theory 332; 12. Bonnie Kent: Rethinking moral dispositions: Scotus on the virtues 352; Bibliography 377; Citations of works attributed to John Duns Scotus 395; Index 405.

115. Wolter, Allan Bernard. 1946. *The Transcendentals and Their Function in the Metaphysics of Duns Scotus*. Washington: Catholic University of America Press.

116. ———. 1962. "The Realism of Scotus." *Journal of Philosophy* no. 59:725-735.

"The realist-nominalist controversy in the fourteenth century owes its origin to Duns Scotus and William Ockham, the two men whom C. S. Peirce in his Harvard lectures on British logicians praised as "decidedly the greatest speculative minds of the middle ages, as well as two of the profoundest metaphysicians that ever lived." Scotus's reputation as a realist, even if his realism be what neo-scholastics call "moderate" and Peirce "halting," rests on his conception of how the specific nature of anything exists in individuals of any given kind."

117. ———. 1990. *The Philosophical Theology of John Duns Scotus*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.

Contents: Foreword by Marilyn McCord Adams VII-IX; Introduction 1;

#### METAPHYSICS AND EPISTEMOLOGY

1. The Formal Distinction 27; 2. The Realism of Scotus 42; 3. A "Reportatio" of Duns Scotus' Merton College. Dialogue on language and metaphysics 54; 4. Scotus' Individuation theory 68; 5. Duns Scotus on intuition, memory, and our knowledge of individuals 98;

#### ACTION THEORY AND ETHICS

6. Duns Scotus on the natural desire for the Supernatural 125; 7. Native freedom of the will as a key to the ethics of Scotus 148; 8. Duns Scotus on the will as rational potency 163; 9. Duns Scotus on the will and morality 181;

#### PHILOSOPHICAL THEOLOGY

10. The "Theologism" of Duns Scotus 209; 11. Duns Scotus and the existence and nature of God 254; 12. Is existence for Scotus a perfection, predicate, or what? 278; 13. Scotus' Paris Lectures on God's knowledge of future events 285;

A Bibliography of Allan B. Wolter, O.F.M. 335; Index of Names 345; Index of Subjects; 347-356.

"Over the last four decades, Allan B. Wolter, O.F.M., has done more than anyone else to make the philosophical theology of John Duns Scotus accessible to the English-speaking world, by preparing English translations of primary sources as well as interpretative essays introducing readers to Scotus' central ideas.

These tasks have been both hindered and made more urgent by the painfully slow progress of the new Vatican edition of Scotus' writings (volume I containing the Prologue of Scotus' Oxford commentary on the Sentences appeared in 1950; as of 1988, only nine volumes have been published, and the critical edition of the Oxford commentary is not yet complete). Although useful, the seventeenth-century Wadding edition is unreliable both in its attributions and readings. Difficult issues of authenticity, dating, and the interrelation of Scotus' works remain. Thus, beginning with his dissertation, Wolter formed the habit of reverting to the manuscripts to produce his own provisional editions, consulting with Vatican editors on the Scotus Commission where possible.

Wolter's career as a Scotus translator began in 1947, when Paul Weiss requested some material for the first volume of his new journal *Review of Metaphysics*. Remarking on Scotus' notoriously tangled Latin, Wolter described the work of translating it as "a special vocation" and vowed never to do it again. Necessity is a sign of calling, however, and Wolter began translating topical selections for summer-school students at the Franciscan Institute in the early fifties. Many of these were published, with Wolter's Latin editions on the facing pages, in *Duns Scotus: Philosophical Writings: A Selection* (first published by Thomas Nelson, 1962, and English only in Bobbs-Merrill's *Library of Liberal Arts* series, 1962; reprinted by Hackett, 1987). Over the years, Wolter has made many more of Scotus' works available, always preferring the format of publishing the English and Latin together: principally, *John Duns Scotus: God and Creatures*, the *Quodlibetal Questions* (with Felix Alluntis); *John Duns Scotus. A Treatise on God as First Principle. A Latin Text with English Translation of the De Primo Principio*; and *Duns Scotus on the Will and Morality*. By now, Wolter has given us enough for a reasonably comprehensive and balanced course on Scotus.

Duns Scotus is not called "the Subtle Doctor" for nothing, however. Diving into his highly technical philosophical corpus without benefit of an interpretive guide is heroic at best. Yet, when Wolter began, reliable guides were unavailable. While not without value, the secondary literature was on the whole confused and confusing, and/or marred by polemical distortion. Together with Wolter's pioneering first book on Scotus, his published dissertation *The Transcendentals and Their Function in the Metaphysics of Duns Scotus* (finished in one semester of intensive interaction with Philotheus Boehner), Wolter's interpretive essays over the last forty years supply us with our needed map. Collected here from many (often inaccessible) journals and books, they are a paradigm of method and a treasure of illuminating insights. Wolter's consistent response to interpretive puzzlement has been to return to the primary sources and to offer readings as detailed and philosophically subtle as the texts themselves. Thus, in the early days, when Scotus' ideas were "known" and criticized mostly from hearsay, Wolter refuted misguided attacks with careful analyses of the texts (see chapters 10 and 11 below). Throughout, Wolter's own philosophical penetration of the material has enabled him to make clear what seems in Scotus complex and confusing (e.g., regarding the formal distinction, chapter 1, and Scotus' theory of universals, chapter 2). Again, Wolter's identification of Scotus' doctrine of the will as the key to his ethics resolves old and false puzzles (see chapters 7-9). At the same time, Wolter's sensitivity to philological issues and to the historical development of Scotus' thought has enabled him to illuminate Scotus' notion of intuitive cognition (see chapter 5) as well as his account of Divine foreknowledge (see chapter 13). All of the essays reflect Wolter's philosophical and historical curiosity and a reasoned and reasonable open-mindedness. Paying Scotus the respect due a great philosopher, Wolter was glad to return to old topics because he always learned something new (e.g., his treatment of formal distinction in chapter 1 makes new points not found in his dissertation). Wolter's interests in analytic philosophy surface as he relates Scotus' semantics and metaphysics to twentieth-century analytic thought (see chapters 3 and 12)." (from the Foreword)

118. ———. 1993. "Reflections on the Life and Works of Scotus." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 67:1-36.
119. ———. 1993. "Scotus on the Divine Origin of Possibility." *American Catholic Philosophical Quarterly* no. 67:95-107.
120. ———. 2003. *Scotus and Ockham. Selected Essays*. St. Bonaventure: Franciscan Institute.
121. Wood, Rega. 1987. "Scotus's Argument for the Existence of God." *Franciscan Studies* no. 47:257-277.

## RELATED PAGES

[On the website "Theory and History of Ontology"](#)

[The Realist Ontology of Duns Scotus](#)

[On the website "History of Logic"](#)

[History of Medieval Logic after Boethius to Late Scholasticism](#)

[Medieval Theories of Supposition \(Reference\) and Mental Language](#)